# cat3advice

Simon H. Fischer

01 March, 2024

Contents
----------

cat3advice	1
Documentation	<b>2</b>
Installation	<b>2</b>
Tutorial	<b>2</b>
The rfb rule         Reference catch $A_y$ Biomass index trend (ratio) $r$ Biomass safeguard $b$ Fishing pressure proxy $f$ Multiplier $m$ Application of rfb rule         Biomass index trend (ratio) $r$ Biomass index trend (ratio) $r$ Biomass index trend (ratio) $r$ Biomass safeguard $b$ Application of rfb rule         Application of rfb rule	<b>2</b> 3 4 5 10 11 <b>12</b> 12 13 14 15
Application of rb rule	<ol> <li>16</li> <li>17</li> <li>18</li> <li>19</li> <li>20</li> <li>26</li> <li>27</li> </ol>
References	28

# cat3advice

cat3advice is an R package that allows the application of the ICES category 3 data-limited harvest control rules (rfb/rb/chr rules) and follows the ICES Technical Guidelines (ICES 2022) (https://doi.org/10.17895/ice s.advice.19801564).

# Documentation

The package documentation contains help files for its functions which also include code examples. See help(package = "cat3advice") for available functions.

The main functions are rfb(), rb(), and chr(). Each of these functions has a help file with code examples (see ?rfb, ?rb ?chr).

# Installation

The latest version of the cat3advice R package can be installed from GitHub with

```
library(remotes)
install_github("shfischer/cat3advice", build_vignettes = TRUE)
```

# Tutorial

This tutorial uses data from the ICES Western English Channel place stock (ple.27.7e) to illustrate the application of the rfb/rb/chr rules. The data are included in the cat3advice R package.

Before reading this vignette, please first read the ICES Technical Guidelines (ICES 2022).

For more details on the rfb rule, please refer to Fischer et al. (2020; 2021b, 2021a, 2023) and for the chr rule, please refer to Fischer et al. (2022, 2023).

```
### load package
library(cat3advice)
```

# The rfb rule

The rfb rule is an index adjusted harvest control rule that uses a biomass index and catch length data. The method is defined as Method 2.1 in the ICES Technical Guidelines (ICES 2022, 9) as

$$A_{y+1} = A_y \times r \times f \times b \times m$$

where  $A_{y+1}$  is the new catch advice,  $A_y$  the previous advice, r the biomass ratio from a biomass index, f the fishing pressure proxy from catch length data, b a biomass safeguard and m a precautionary multiplier. Furthermore, the change in the advice is restricted by a stability clause that only allows changes of between +20% and -30% relative to the previous advice, but the application of the stability clause is conditional on b = 1 and turned off when b < 1.

The rfb rule should be applied biennially, i.e. the catch advice is valid for two years.

Please note that any change from the default configuration should be supported by case-specific simulations.

# Reference catch $A_{y}$

The reference catch  $A_y$  is usually the most recently advised catch. In a typical ICES setting, an assessment is conducted in an assessment (intermediate) year y to give advice for the following advice year y + 1, this is the advice for year y:

```
### load plaice catch and advice data
data("ple7e_catch")
tail(ple7e_catch)
#> year advice landings discards catch
#> 31 2017 2714 2128 821 2949
```

```
#> 32 2018
           3257
                      1880
                                633
                                    2513
#> 33 2019
           3648
                      1725
                                366 2091
#> 34 2020
            2721
                      1373
                                514 1888
#> 35 2021
            2177
                      1403
                                211 1615
#> 36 2022
           1742
                        NA
                                 NA
                                       NA
### get reference catch
A <- A(ple7e_catch, units = "tonnes")</pre>
А
#> An object of class "A".
#> Value: 1742
```

The ICES Technical Guidelines (ICES 2022) specify that if the realised catch is very different from the advised catch, the reference catch could be replaced by an average of recent catches:

```
### use 3-year average
A(ple7e_catch, units = "tonnes", basis = "average catch", avg_years = 3)
#> An object of class "A".
#> Value: 1864.6666666666667
```

The reference catch can also be defined manually:

```
### define manually
A(2000, units = "tonnes")
#> An object of class "A".
#> Value: 2000
```

## Biomass index trend (ratio) r

The biomass index trend r calculates the trend in the biomass index over last the five years, by dividing the mean of the last two years by the mean of the three preceding years:

$$r = \sum_{i=y-2}^{y-1} (I_i/2) / \sum_{i=y-5}^{y-2} (I_i/3)$$

The ratio is calculated with the function r. Index data should be provided as a data.frame with columns year and index.

```
### load plaice data
data("ple7e_idx")
tail(ple7e_idx)
#>
    year
               index
#> 14 2016 1.3579990
#> 15 2017 1.3323659
#> 16 2018 1.1327596
#> 17 2019 0.8407277
#> 18 2020 0.5996326
#> 19 2021 1.0284297
### calculate biomass trend
r <- r(ple7e_idx, units = "kg/hr")</pre>
r
\#> An object of class "rfb_r".
#> Value: 0.73871806243358
### ICES advice style table
advice(r)
```

#>			
#>	Stock biomass trend		
#>			
#>	Index A (2020,2021)	1	0.81 kg/hr
#>	Index B (2017,2018,2019)	1	1.10 kg/hr
#>	r: stock biomass trend (index ratio A/B)	1	0.74

### plot index

### horizontal orange lines correspond to the the 2/3-year averages
plot(r)



```
### when the value of r is known
r(1)
#> An object of class "r".
#> Value: 1
```

Biomass index data are usually available until the year before the advice year. More recent data can be used and the function automatically picks the most recent data provided to it.

#### **Biomass safeguard** b

The biomass safeguard reduces the advice when the biomass index I falls below a threshold value  $I_{\text{trigger}}$ :

$$b = \min\{1, I_{y-1}/I_{\text{trigger}}\}$$

By default, the trigger value is defined based on the lowest observed index value  $I_{\text{loss}}$  as  $I_{\text{trigger}} = 1.4I_{\text{loss}}$ .

The biomass safeguard is calculated with the function **b**:

```
### use same plaice data as before
### application in first year with new calculation of Itrigger
b <- b(ple7e_idx, units = "kg/hr")
b
#> An object of class "b".
#> Value: 1
### ICES advice style table
advice(b)
#> ------
#> Biomass safeguard
#> ------
#> Last index value (I2021)
/ 1.03 kg/hr
```

```
#> Index trigger value (Itrigger = Iloss x 1.4) / 0.39 kg/hr
#> b: index relative to trigger value, / 1.00
#> min{I2021/Itrigger, 1} /
```

# ### plot plot(b)



```
### plot b and r in one figure
plot(r, b)
```



**Please note that**  $I_{\text{trigger}}$  should only be defined once in the first year of the application of the rfb rule. In the following years, the same value should be used. For this purpose, **b** allows the direct definition of  $I_{\text{trigger}}$ , or, more conveniently,  $I_{\text{trigger}}$  can be based on the year in which  $I_{\text{loss}}$  is defined:

```
### in following years, Itrigger should NOT be updated
### i.e. provide value for Itrigger
b(ple7e_idx, units = "kg/hr", Itrigger = 0.3924721)
#> An object of class "b".
#> Value: 1
#### alternatively, the reference year for Iloss can be used
b(ple7e_idx, units = "kg/hr", yr_ref = 2007)
#> An object of class "b".
#> Value: 1
```

# Fishing pressure proxy f

Catch length data are used to approximate the fishing pressure. The mean length of fish in the catch compared to a reference length is used as the indicator.

#### Length data

The fishing pressure proxy requires length data from the catch. Ideally, length data for several years are provided in a data.frame with columns year, length and numbers. An additional column catch\_category specifying the catch category, such as discards and landings, is optional.

```
data("ple7e_length")
head(ple7e_length)
#>
   year
                      catch_category length numbers
#> 1 2018
                         BMS landing
                                         100
                                                0.00
#> 2 2018
                            Discards
                                         100 5887.55
#> 3 2018 Logbook Registered Discard
                                         100
                                                0.00
#> 4 2015
                            Discards
                                        120
                                             128.60
#> 5 2016
                         BMS landing
                                         140
                                                0.00
#> 6 2018
                         BMS landing
                                         140
                                                0.00
```

#### Length at first capture $L_c$

Only length data above the length at first capture  $L_c$  are used to avoid noisy data from fish that are not fully selected.  $L_c$  is defined as the first length class where the abundance is at or above 50% of the mode of the length distribution and can be calculated with the function Lc():

```
lc <- Lc(ple7e_length)</pre>
lc
#> 2014 2015 2016 2017 2018 2019 2020 2021
#> 240
         260 260 270 260 260 260
                                           270
plot(lc)
                           2014
                                            2015
                                                             2016
               8e+05
               6e+05
               4e+05
               2e+05
               0e+00
                                                                          Length
                           2017
                                            2018
                                                             2019
                                                                               Lc
               8e+05
                                                                               mode
            Numbers
               6e+05
               4e+05
               2e+05
                                                                          Numbers
               0e+00
                                                                              mode
                                                          200 400 600
                                                       0
                           2020
                                            2021
                                                                          ----- mode/2
               8e+05
               6e+05
               4e+05
               2e+05
               0e+00
                        200 400 600
                                         200 400 600
                      0
                                      0
```

Length

 $L_c$  can change from year to year. Therefore, it is recommended to pool data from several (e.g. 5) years:

```
lc <- Lc(ple7e_length, pool = 2017:2021)
lc
#> [1] 260
plot(lc)
```



If length data are noisy, the size of the length classes can be increased:

```
### use 20mm length classes
plot(Lc(ple7e_length, pool = 2017:2021, lstep = 20))
```



Once defined,  $L_c$  should be kept constant and the same value used for all data years.  $L_c$  should only be changed if there are strong changes in the fishery or data.

## Mean length

After defining  $L_c$ , the mean (annual) catch length  $L_{\text{mean}}$  above  $L_c$  can be calculated:

```
### calculate annual mean length
lmean <- Lmean(data = ple7e_length, Lc = lc, units = "mm")
lmean
#> 2014 2015 2016 2017 2018 2019 2020 2021
#> 310.6955 322.8089 333.1876 326.9434 326.5741 339.8752 321.5979 319.1974
plot(lmean)
```



If length data are noisy, the size of the length classes can be increased:





#### **Reference length**

The reference length follows the concepts of Beverton and Holt (1957) and is calculated as derived by Jardim, Azevedo, and Brites (2015):

 $L_{F=M} = 0.75L_c + 0.25L_{\infty}$ 

where  $L_{F=M}$  is the MSY reference length,  $L_c$  the length at first capture as defined above, and  $L_{\infty}$  the von Bertalanffy asymptotic length. This simple equation assumes that fishing at F = M can be used as a proxy for MSY and that M/k = 1.5 (where M is the natural mortality and k the von Bertalanffy individual growth rate). The reference length can be calculated with

```
lref <- Lref(Lc = 264, Linf = 585, units = "mm")
lref
#> [1] 344.25
```

The reference length  $L_{F=M}$  should only be defined once in the first year of the application of the rfb rule. In the following years, the same value should be used.

Deviations from the assumptions of F = M and M/k = 1.5 are possible following Equation A.3 of Jardim, Azevedo, and Brites (2015)  $L_{F=\gamma M, k=\theta M} = (\theta L_{\infty} + L_c(\gamma + 1))/(\theta + \gamma + 1)$  and can be used by providing arguments gamma and theta to Lref().

#### Indicator

The length indicator f is defined as

$$f = L_{\text{mean}}/L_{F=M}$$

and can be calculated with f():

```
f <- f(Lmean = lmean, Lref = lref, units = "mm")</pre>
f
#> An object of class "f".
#> Value: 0.927225455656142
### ICES advice style table
advice(f)
                            _____
#> -----
#> Fishing pressure proxy
#> -----
                                                1
#> Mean catch length (Lmean = L2021)
                                                                       320 mm
#> MSY proxy length (LF=M)
                                                1
                                                                       340 mm
#> f: Fishing pressure proxy relative to MSY proxy
                                               1
#>
     (L2021/LF=M)
                                                                         0.93
### plot
plot(f)
```



In this case, the mean catch length (orange curve) is always below the MSY proxy reference length (blue horizontal line), indicating that the fishing pressure was above  $F_{MSY}$ .

## Multiplier m

The multiplier m is a tuning parameter and ensures that the catch advice is precautionary in the long term.

The value of m is set depending on the von Bertalanffy parameter k (individual growth rate), with m = 0.95 for stocks with k < 0.2/year and m = 0.90 for stocks with 0.2year<sup>-1</sup>  $\leq k < 0.32$ year<sup>-1</sup>. The multiplier can be calculated with the function m():

```
# for k=0.1/year
m <- m(hcr = "rfb", k = 0.1)
\#> Multiplier (m) for the rfb rule: selecting value based on k: m=0.95
m
#> An object of class "m".
#> Value: 0.95
### alias for rfb rule
rfb m(k = 0.1)
\#> Multiplier (m) for the rfb rule: selecting value based on k: m=0.95
#> An object of class "rfb_m".
#> Value: 0.95
### ICES advice style table
advice(m)
#> --
#> Precautionary multiplier to maintain biomass above Blim with 95% probability
#> -----
#> m: multiplier
                                                                                 0.95
                                                     1
      (generic multiplier based on life history)
#>
```

Please note that the multiplier m does not lead to a continuous reduction in the catch advice. The components of the rfb rule are multiplicative, this means that m could be considered as part of component f and essentially adjusts the reference length  $L_{F=M}$  to  $L'_{F=M}$ :

$$A_{y+1} = A_y \ r \ f \ b \ m = A_y \ r \ \frac{L_{\text{mean}}}{L_{F=M}} \ b \ m = A_y \ r \ \frac{L_{\text{mean}}}{L_{F=M}/m} \ b = A_y \ r \ \frac{L_{\text{mean}}}{L'_{F=M}} \ b$$

# Application of rfb rule

Now we have all the components of the rfb rule and can apply it:

advice <- rfb(A = A, r = r, f = f, b = b, m = m, discard\_rate = 27)
advice
#> An object of class "rfb".
#> Value: 1219.4

A discard rate in % can be provided to the argument discard\_rate and this means the advice is provided for the catch and landings.

The rfb rule includes a stability clause that restricts changes to +20% and -30%. This stability clause is conditional on the biomass safeguard and is only applied if b = 1 but turned off when b < 1.

cat3advice can print a table similar to the table presented in ICES advice sheets in which all numbers are rounded following ICES rounding rules:

ad	vice(advice)							
#> #>	Previous catch advice Ay (advised catch for 2022)							
#> #>	Stock biomass trend							
#> #>	 Index A (2020,2021)	/		0.81 kg/hr				
#>	Index B (2017,2018,2019)	1		1.10 kg/hr				
#>	r: stock biomass trend (index ratio A/B)	1		0.74				
#> #>	Fishing pressure proxy							
#> #>	Mean catch length (Lmean = L2021)			 320 mm				
#>	MSY proxy length (LF=M)			340 mm				
#>	f: Fishing pressure proxy relative to MSY proxy							
#>	(L2021/LF=M)	/		0.93				
#> #>	Biomass safeguard							
#> #>	Last index value (12021)			1.03 ka/hr				
#>	Index triager value (Itriager = Iloss $x 1.4$ )			0.39 ka/hr				
#>	b: index relative to trigger value,	1		1.00				
#>	min{I2021/Itrigger, 1}	1						
#> #>	Precautionary multiplier to maintain biomass ab	ove Bl	im with 95% pr	obability				
#> #>	m: multiplier			0.95				
#>	(generic multiplier based on life history)							
#>	RFB calculation ( $r*f*b*m$ )			1134 tonnes				
#>	Stability clause (+20%/-30% compared to Au.							
#>	only applied if b=1)		Applied /	0.7				
#>	Catch advice for 2023 and 2024		11					
#>	(Ay * stability clause)			1219 tonnes				
#>	Discard rate	1		2.7%				

# The rb rule

The rb rule is essentially a simplified version of the rfb rule without component f, i.e. applicable to stocks without reliable catch length data. This method is meant as a last resort and should be avoid if possible.

The rb rule is an index adjusted harvest control rule that adjusts the catch advice based on a biomass index but does not have a target. The method is defined as Method 2.3 in the ICES Technical Guidelines (ICES 2022, 15) as

$$A_{y+1} = A_y \times r \times b \times m$$

where  $A_{y+1}$  is the new catch advice,  $A_y$  the previous advice, r the biomass ratio from a biomass index, b a biomass safeguard and m a precautionary multiplier. Furthermore, the change in the advice is restricted by a stability clause that only allows changes of between +20% and -30% relative to the previous advice, but the application of the stability clause is conditional on b = 1 and turned off when b < 1.

The rb rule should be applied biennially, i.e. the catch advice is valid for two years.

Please note that any change from the default configuration should be supported by case-specific simulations.

#### Reference catch $A_y$

The reference catch  $A_y$  is usually the most recently advised catch. In a typical ICES setting, an assessment is conducted in an assessment (intermediate) year y to give advice for the following advice year y + 1, this is the advice for year y:

```
### load plaice catch and advice data
data("ple7e_catch")
tail(ple7e catch)
#>
      year advice landings discards catch
#> 31 2017
            2714
                      2128
                                 821 2949
#> 32 2018
             3257
                                 633
                      1880
                                      2513
#> 33 2019
             3648
                                 366
                                      2091
                      1725
#> 34 2020
             2721
                                 514
                                      1888
                      1373
#> 35 2021
             2177
                      1403
                                 211
                                      1615
#> 36 2022
            1742
                        NA
                                  NA
                                        NA
### get reference catch
A <- A(ple7e_catch, units = "tonnes")
Α
#> An object of class "A".
#> Value: 1742
```

The ICES Technical Guidelines (ICES 2022) specify that if the realised catch is very different from the advised catch, the reference catch could be replaced by an average of recent catches:

```
### use 3-year average
A(ple7e_catch, units = "tonnes", basis = "average catch", avg_years = 3)
#> An object of class "A".
#> Value: 1864.6666666666667
```

The reference catch can also be defined manually:

```
### use 3-year average
A(2000, units = "tonnes")
#> An object of class "A".
#> Value: 2000
```

# Biomass index trend (ratio) r

The biomass index trend r calculates the trend in the biomass index over last the five years, by dividing the mean of the last two years by the mean of the three preceding years:

$$r = \sum_{i=y-2}^{y-1} (I_i/2) / \sum_{i=y-5}^{y-2} (I_i/3)$$

The ratio is calculated with the function r. Index data should be provided as a data.frame with columns year and index.

```
### load plaice data
data("ple7e_idx")
tail(ple7e_idx)
#> year
           index
#> 14 2016 1.3579990
#> 15 2017 1.3323659
#> 16 2018 1.1327596
#> 17 2019 0.8407277
#> 18 2020 0.5996326
#> 19 2021 1.0284297
### calculate biomass trend
r <- r(ple7e_idx, units = "kg/hr")</pre>
r
\#> An object of class "rfb_r".
#> Value: 0.73871806243358
### ICES advice style table
advice(r)
#> ------
                  _____
#> Stock biomass trend
#> -----
                                             1
#> Index A (2020,2021)
                                                               0.81 kg/hr
#> Index B (2017,2018,2019)
                                             1
                                                               1.10 kg/hr
#> r: stock biomass trend (index ratio A/B)
                                             1
                                                                   0.74
### plot index
### horizontal orange lines correspond to the the 2/3-year averages
```

```
plot(r)
```



```
r(1)
\#> An object of class "r".
#> Value: 1
```

Biomass index data are usually available until the year before the advice year. More recent data can be used and the function automatically picks the most recent data provided to it.

## Biomass safeguard b

The biomass safeguard reduces the advice when the biomass index I falls below a threshold value  $I_{\text{trigger}}$ :

$$b = \min\{1, I_{y-1}/I_{\text{trigger}}\}$$

By default, the trigger value is defined based on the lowest observed index value  $I_{\rm loss}$  as  $I_{\rm trigger} = 1.4 I_{\rm loss}$ .

The biomass safeguard is calculated with the function **b**:

```
### use same plaice data as before
### application in first year with new calculation of Itrigger
b <- b(ple7e_idx, units = "kg/hr")</pre>
b
#> An object of class "b".
#> Value: 1
### ICES advice style table
advice(b)
#> -----
                                   _____
#> Biomass safeguard
#> -----
#> Last index value (I2021)
                                                   1
                                                                        1.03 kg/hr
#> Index trigger value (Itrigger = Iloss x 1.4)
                                                   1
                                                                        0.39 kg/hr
#> b: index relative to trigger value,
                                                   1
                                                                              1.00
                                                    1
     min{I2021/Itrigger, 1}
#>
### plot
```

plot(b)



### plot b and r in one figure
plot(r, b)



**Please note that**  $I_{\text{trigger}}$  should only be defined once in the first year of the application of the rb rule. In the following years, the same value should be used. For this purpose, b allows the direct definition of  $I_{\text{trigger}}$ , or, more conveniently,  $I_{\text{trigger}}$  can be based on the year in which  $I_{\text{loss}}$  is defined:

```
### in following years, Itrigger should NOT be updated
### i.e. provide value for Itrigger
b(ple7e_idx, units = "kg/hr", Itrigger = 0.3924721)
#> An object of class "b".
#> Value: 1
### alternatively, the reference year for Iloss can be used
b(ple7e_idx, units = "kg/hr", yr_ref = 2007)
#> An object of class "b".
#> Value: 1
```

# Multiplier m

The multiplier m is a tuning parameter and ensures that the catch advice is precautionary in the long term.

The value of m is set to m = 0.5 for all stocks. The multiplier can be calculated with the function m():

```
m <- m(hcr = "rb")
m
#> An object of class "m".
#> Value: 0.5
#### alias for rb rule
rb_m()
```

```
#> An object of class "rb_m".
#> Value: 0.5
### ICES advice style table
advice(m)
#> -----
#> Precautionary multiplier to maintain biomass above Blim with 95% probability
#> -----
#> m: multiplier / 0.50
#> (generic multiplier based on life history) /
```

Please note that for the rb rule, the multiplier m does lead to a continuous reduction in the catch advice because the rb rule does not include a target.

#### Application of rb rule

. . . . . .

Now we have all the components of the rb rule and can apply it:

```
advice <- rb(A = A, r = r, b = b, m = m, discard_rate = 27)
advice
#> An object of class "rb".
#> Value: 1219.4
```

A discard rate in % can be provided to the argument discard\_rate and this means the advice is provided for the catch and landings.

The rb rule includes a stability clause that restricts changes to +20 and -30. This stability clause is conditional on the biomass safeguard and is only applied if b = 1 but turned off when b < 1.

cat3advice can print a table similar to the table presented in ICES advice sheets in which all numbers are rounded following ICES rounding rules:

aa' #>	/ice(advice)				
#>	Previous catch advice Ay (advised catch for 2	2022)		1742	tonnes
#> #>	Stock biomass trend				
#> #>	Index A (2020,2021)	/		0.81	kg/hr
#>	Index B (2017,2018,2019)	1		1.10	kg/hr
#>	r: stock biomass trend (index ratio A/B)	1			0.74
#> #>	Biomass safeguard				
#> #>	Last index value (I2021)	/		1.03	kg/hr
#>	Index trigger value (Itrigger = Iloss x 1.4)	1		0.39	kg/hr
#>	b: index relative to trigger value,	1			1.00
#>	<pre>min{I2021/Itrigger, 1}</pre>	1			
#> #>	Precautionary multiplier to maintain biomass	above Bl	im with 95% prob	abili	 ty
#> #>	m: multiplier				0.50
#>	(generic multiplier based on life history)	) /			
#>	RB calculation $(r*b*m)$	1		643	tonnes
#>	Stability clause (+20%/-30% compared to Ay,	1			
#>	only applied if b=1)	/	Applied		0.7

#> Ca	tch advice for 2023 and 2024	1		
#>	(Ay * stability clause)	1	1219	tonnes
#> Di	scard rate	1		27%
#> Pr	rojected landings corresponding to advice	1	890	tonnes
#> %	advice change	1		-30%

# The chr rule

The chr rule is a (relative) harvest rate-based harvest control rule. The relative harvest rate is defined by dividing the catch by the values from a biomass index. It is not an absolute harvest rate because the absolute stock size is unknown. The method is defined as Method 2.2 in the ICES Technical Guidelines (ICES 2022, 13) as

$$A_{y+1} = I_{y-1} \times F_{\text{proxyMSY}} \times b \times m$$

where  $A_{y+1}$  is the new catch advice,  $I_{y-1}$  the last biomass index value,  $F_{\text{proxyMSY}}$  the (relative) harvest rate target, b a biomass safeguard and m a precautionary multiplier. Furthermore, the change in the advice is restricted by a stability clause that only allows changes of between +20% and -30% relative to the previous advice, but the application of the stability clause is conditional on b = 1 and turned off when b < 1.

The chr rule should be applied annually, i.e. the catch advice is valid for one year.

Please note that any change from the default configuration should be supported by case-specific simulations.

## Reference catch $A_y$

A reference catch  $A_y$  is needed for the application of the stability clause. The reference catch  $A_y$  is usually the most recently advised catch. In a typical ICES setting, an assessment is conducted in an assessment (intermediate) year y to give advice for the following advice year y + 1, this is the advice for year y:

```
### load plaice catch and advice data
data("ple7e_catch")
tail(ple7e_catch)
      year advice landings discards catch
#>
#> 31 2017
             2714
                       2128
                                 821
                                      2949
#> 32 2018
             3257
                       1880
                                 633
                                      2513
#> 33 2019
             3648
                       1725
                                 366
                                      2091
#> 34 2020
             2721
                       1373
                                 514
                                      1888
#> 35 2021
             2177
                       1403
                                 211
                                      1615
#> 36 2022
             1742
                                  NA
                                        NA
                         NA
### get reference catch
A <- A(ple7e_catch, units = "tonnes")
Α
#> An object of class "A".
#> Value: 1742
```

The ICES Technical Guidelines (ICES 2022) specify that if the realised catch is very different from the advised catch, the reference catch could be replaced by an average of recent catches:

```
### use 3-year average
A(ple7e_catch, units = "tonnes", basis = "average catch", avg_years = 3)
#> An object of class "A".
#> Value: 1864.6666666666667
```

The reference catch can also be defined manually:

```
### use 3-year average
A(2000, units = "tonnes")
#> An object of class "A".
#> Value: 2000
```

# Biomass index value $I_{y-1}$

 $I_{y-1}$  is the most recent value from the biomass index. This is usually a value from the year before the assessment year (y) but a more recent value can be used if available.

Index data should be provided as a data.frame with columns year and index.

```
### load plaice data
data("ple7e_idx")
tail(ple7e_idx)
#>
     year
               index
#> 14 2016 1.3579990
#> 15 2017 1.3323659
#> 16 2018 1.1327596
#> 17 2019 0.8407277
#> 18 2020 0.5996326
#> 19 2021 1.0284297
### get most recent value
i <- I(ple7e_idx, units = "kg/hr")</pre>
i
#> An object of class "I".
#> Value: 1.028429723
### ICES advice style table
advice(i)
#> -----
#> Biomass index
#> -----
                                                     1
#> I: most recent biomass index (I2021)
                                                                          1.03 kg/hr
```

### plot index
plot(i)



### when the value of r is known
I(1)
#> An object of class "I".

#### *#> Value: 1*

## Biomass safeguard b

The biomass safeguard reduces the advice when the biomass index I falls below a threshold value  $I_{\text{trigger}}$ :

$$b = \min\{1, I_{y-1}/I_{\text{trigger}}\}$$

By default, the trigger value is defined based on the lowest observed index value  $I_{\rm loss}$  as  $I_{\rm trigger} = 1.4 I_{\rm loss}$ .

The biomass safeguard is calculated with the function **b**:

```
### use same plaice data as before
### application in first year with new calculation of Itrigger
b <- b(ple7e_idx, units = "kg/hr")</pre>
b
#> An object of class "b".
#> Value: 1
### ICES advice style table
advice(b)
                            _____
#> -----
#> Biomass safequard
#> -----
#> Last index value (I2021)
                                                  1
                                                                      1.03 kg/hr
#> Index trigger value (Itrigger = Iloss x 1.4)
                                                  1
                                                                      0.39 kg/hr
#> b: index relative to trigger value,
                                                  1
                                                                           1.00
     min{I2021/Itrigger, 1}
#>
```

```
### plot
plot(b)
```



**Please note that**  $I_{\text{trigger}}$  should only be defined once in the first year of the application of the chr rule. In the following years, the same value should be used. For this purpose, **b** allows the direct definition of  $I_{\text{trigger}}$ , or, more conveniently,  $I_{\text{trigger}}$  can be based on the year in which  $I_{\text{loss}}$  is defined:

```
### in following years, Itrigger should NOT be updated
### i.e. provide value for Itrigger
b(ple7e_idx, units = "kg/hr", Itrigger = 0.3924721)
#> An object of class "b".
#> Value: 1
### alternatively, the reference year for Iloss can be used
b(ple7e_idx, units = "kg/hr", yr_ref = 2007)
```

```
#> An object of class "b".
#> Value: 1
```

# Target harvest rate $F_{proxyMSY}$

The target harvest rate  $F_{\text{proxyMSY}}$  defines the target for the chr rule and is a proxy for MSY. The standard approach to define  $F_{\text{proxyMSY}}$  is to use catch length data, find years in which the mean catch length  $L_{\text{mean}}$ is above a reference length  $(L_{F=M})$ , calculate the harvest rate for these years, and use their average. The approach is the same as the one used for component f of the rfb rule described above. This needs to be done only once in the first year of the application of the chr rule. In subsequent years, no length data are required.

#### Length data

Ideally, length data for several years are provided in a data.frame with columns year, length and numbers. An additional column catch\_category specifying the catch category, such as discards and landings, is optional.

```
data("ple7e_length")
head(ple7e_length)
```

1100		(PTOIC			
#>		year	$catch\_category$	length	numbers
#>	1	2018	BMS landing	100	0.00
#>	2	2018	Discards	100	5887.55
#>	3	2018	Logbook Registered Discard	100	0.00
#>	4	2015	Discards	120	128.60
#>	5	2016	BMS landing	140	0.00
#>	6	2018	BMS landing	140	0.00

## Length at first capture $L_c$

Only length data above the length at first capture  $L_c$  are used to avoid noisy data from fish that are not fully selected.  $L_c$  is defined as the first length class where the abundance is at or above 50% of the mode of the length distribution and can be calculated with the function Lc():

```
lc <- Lc(ple7e_length)
lc
#> 2014 2015 2016 2017 2018 2019 2020 2021
#> 240 260 260 270 260 260 260 270
plot(lc)
```



L<sub>c</sub> can change from year to year. Therefore, it is recommended to pool data from several (e.g. 5) years: lc <- Lc(ple7e\_length, pool = 2017:2021) lc #> [1] 260 plot(lc)



If length data are noisy, the size of the length classes can be increased:
### use 20mm length classes
plot(Lc(ple7e\_length, pool = 2017:2021, lstep = 20))



Once defined,  $L_c$  should be kept constant and the same value used for all data years.  $L_c$  should only be changed if there are strong changes in the fishery or data.

#### Mean length

After defining  $L_c$ , the mean (annual) catch length  $L_{\text{mean}}$  above  $L_c$  can be calculated:

```
### calculate annual mean length
lmean <- Lmean(data = ple7e_length, Lc = lc, units = "mm")
lmean
#> 2014 2015 2016 2017 2018 2019 2020 2021
#> 310.6955 322.8089 333.1876 326.9434 326.5741 339.8752 321.5979 319.1974
plot(lmean)
```



If length data are noisy, the size of the length classes can be increased:

```
### use 20mm length classes
plot(Lmean(data = ple7e_length, Lc = lc, units = "mm", lstep = 20))
```



#### **Reference length**

The reference length follows the concepts of Beverton and Holt (1957) and is calculated as derived by Jardim, Azevedo, and Brites (2015):

$$L_{F=M} = 0.75L_c + 0.25L_{\infty}$$

where  $L_{F=M}$  is the MSY reference length,  $L_c$  the length at first capture as defined above, and  $L_{\infty}$  the von Bertalanffy asymptotic length. This simple equation assumes that fishing at F = M can be used as a proxy for MSY and that M/k = 1.5 (where M is the natural mortality and k the von Bertalanffy individual growth rate). The reference length can be calculated with

```
lref <- Lref(Lc = 264, Linf = 585, units = "mm")
lref
#> [1] 344.25
### use a dummy value here for illustrative purposes of the chr rule
lref <- Lref(330, units = "mm")</pre>
```

Deviations from the assumptions of F = M and M/k = 1.5 are possible following Equation A.3 of Jardim, Azevedo, and Brites (2015)  $L_{F=\gamma M, k=\theta M} = (\theta L_{\infty} + L_c(\gamma + 1))/(\theta + \gamma + 1)$  and can be used by providing arguments gamma and theta to Lref().

#### Indicator

The mean catch length relative to the reference  $f = L_{\text{mean}}/L_{F=M}$  is used as an indicator. The same function (f()) as used in the rfb rule (described above) can be used to calculate the indicator time series:

f <- f(Lmean = lmean, Lref = lref, units = "mm")
plot(f)</pre>



In this case, the mean catch length (orange curve) is above the reference length in two years, indicating that the fishing pressure was below  $F_{MSY}$  in these two years.

ICES advice sheets typically show the inverse indicator ratio. This can be plotted by adding an inverse = TRUE argument to plot():

plot(f, inverse = TRUE)



The time series of the indicator values can be printed with

```
indicator(f)
#> # A tibble: 8 x 6
#> # Groups:
               year, Lc [8]
#>
      year
              Lc Lmean Lref indicator inverse_indicator
#>
     <int> <int> <dbl> <dbl>
                                  <dbl>
                                                     <dbl>
#> 1 2014
             260
                  311.
                          330
                                  0.942
                                                     1.06
#> 2
     2015
             260
                  323.
                          330
                                  0.978
                                                     1.02
#> 3 2016
                  333.
                         330
                                                     0.990
             260
                                  1.01
```

#>	4	2017	260	327.	330	0.991	1.01
#>	5	2018	260	327.	330	0.990	1.01
#>	6	2019	260	340.	330	1.03	0.971
#>	7	2020	260	322.	330	0.975	1.03
#>	8	2021	260	319.	330	0.967	1.03

and the inverse values also with

```
inverse indicator(f)
#> # A tibble: 8 x 2
#> # Groups:
                year [8]
      year inverse_indicator
#>
#>
     \langle int \rangle
                         <dbl>
     2014
#> 1
                         1.06
#> 2 2015
                         1.02
#> 3 2016
                         0.990
#> 4 2017
                         1.01
#> 5 2018
                         1.01
#> 6 2019
                         0.971
#> 7 2020
                         1.03
#> 8 2021
                         1.03
```

#### Harvest rate

For the estimation of the target harvest rate, the harvest rate needs to be calculated with HR().

```
### catch data
data("ple7e_catch")
### index data
data("ple7e_idx")
### combine catch and index data into single data.frame
df <- merge(ple7e_catch, ple7e_idx, all = TRUE) # combine catch & index data
### calculate harvest rate
hr <- HR(df, units catch = "tonnes", units index = "kg/hr")</pre>
hr
#> An object of class "HR".
#> Value(s):
#>
       2003
                2004
                          2005
                                   2006
                                            2007
                                                      2008
                                                               2009
                                                                         2010
                                                                                  2011
                                                                                           2012
                                                                                                     2013
#> 2882.668 2023.556 2890.803 2779.141 4526.691 3242.396 2091.990 1903.229 2056.537 2161.624 1394.154
#>
       2014
                2015
                          2016
                                   2017
                                            2018
                                                      2019
                                                               2020
                                                                         2021
#> 1204.222 1575.161 1937.409 2213.356 2218.476 2487.131 3148.595 1570.355
```

The harvest rate can only be calculated for years in which both catch and index data are available. The harvest rate and its input data can be plotted automatically:

plot(hr)



# Harvest rate target $F_{proxyMSY}$

Now we can use the indicator and (relative) harvest rate time series to calculate the target harvest rate:

```
### calculate (relative) target harvest rate
F <- F(hr, f)
F
#> An object of class "F".
#> Value: 2212.27020813614
plot(F)
#> Warning: Removed 17 rows containing missing values (`geom_line()`).
```



The years selected for the target harvest rate are indicated by orange points.

# Multiplier m

The multiplier m is a tuning parameter and ensures that the catch advice is precautionary in the long term.

By default, the value of m is set to m = 0.5. The multiplier can be calculated with the function m():

```
m \leftarrow m(hcr = "chr")
m
#> An object of class "m".
#> Value: 0.5
### alias for chr rule
chr m()
#> An object of class "chr_m".
#> Value: 0.5
### ICES advice style table
advice(m)
                  _____
#> -----
#> Precautionary multiplier to maintain biomass above Blim with 95% probability
#> -----
                                         1
#> m: multiplier
                                                              0.50
  (generic multiplier based on life history)
                                         1
#>
```

Please note that the multiplier m does not lead to a continuous reduction in the catch advice. The components of the chr rule are multiplicative, this means that m could be considered as adjusting the target harvest rate  $F_{\text{MSY}}$  to  $F'_{\text{MSY}}$ :

$$A_{y+1} = I \times F_{\text{proxyMSY}} \times b \times m = I \times \frac{F_{\text{proxyMSY}}}{1/m} \times b = I \times F'_{\text{proxyMSY}} \times b$$

## Application of chr rule

Now we have all the components of the chr rule and can apply it:

advice <- chr(A = A, I = i, F = F, b = b, m = m, discard\_rate = 27)
advice
#> An object of class "chr".
#> Value: 1219.4

A discard rate in % can be provided to the argument discard\_rate and this means the advice is provided for the catch and landings.

The chr rule includes a stability clause that restricts changes to +20% and -30%. This stability clause is conditional on the biomass safeguard and is only applied if b = 1 but turned off when b < 1.

cat3advice can print a table similar to the table presented in ICES advice sheets in which all numbers are rounded following ICES rounding rules:

```
advice(advice)
#> -----
#> Previous catch advice Ay (advised catch for 2022) |
                                      1742 tonnes
#> -----
#> Biomass index
#> ------
#> I: most recent biomass index (I2021)
                           1
                                       1.03 kg/hr
#> -----
#> MSY proxy harvest rate
#> -----
#> FMSYproxy: MSY proxy harvest rate (average of
                           1
#> the ratio of catch to biomass index for the
                            1
```

#> #>	years for which f>1, where f=Lmean/LF=M)	1	2200	tonnes /	kg/hr
#/ #>	Biomass safeguard				
#> #>	Last index value (I2021)			1.03	kg/hr
#>	Index trigger value (Itrigger = Iloss $x$ 1.4)	1		0.39	kg/hr
#>	b: index relative to trigger value,	1			1.00
#>	min{I2021/Itrigger, 1}	1			
#>					
#>	Precautionary multiplier to maintain biomass	above Bli	n with 95% j	probabilit	zy
#>					
#>	m: multiplier	/			0.50
#>	(generic multiplier based on life history)	1			
#>	CHR calculation (I*F*b*m)	1		1138 t	tonnes
#>	Stability clause (+20%/-30% compared to Ay,	1			
#>	only applied if b=1)	1	Applied	/	0.7
#>	Catch advice for 2023	1			
#>	(Ay * stability clause)	1		1219 t	tonnes
#>	Discard rate	1			27%
#>	Projected landings corresponding to advice	1		890 t	tonnes
#>	% advice change	1			-30%

# References

- Beverton, Raymond J. H., and Sidney J. Holt. 1957. On the Dynamics of Exploited Fish Populations. Fishery Investigation Series 2. London: HMSO for Ministry of Agriculture, Fisheries; Food.
- Fischer, Simon H., José A A De Oliveira, John D. Mumford, and Laurence T. Kell. 2021a. "Application of explicit precautionary principles in data-limited fisheries management." *ICES Journal of Marine Science* 78 (8): 2931–42. https://doi.org/10.1093/icesjms/fsab169.
  - ——. 2022. "Exploring a relative harvest rate strategy for moderately data-limited fisheries management." Edited by M S M Siddeek. *ICES Journal of Marine Science* 79 (6): 1730–41. https://doi.org/10.1093/ic esjms/fsac103.
- Fischer, Simon H., José A. A. De Oliveira, and Laurence T. Kell. 2020. "Linking the performance of a data-limited empirical catch rule to life-history traits." *ICES Journal of Marine Science* 77 (5): 1914–26. https://doi.org/10.1093/icesjms/fsaa054.
- Fischer, Simon H., José A. A. De Oliveira, John D. Mumford, and Laurence T. Kell. 2021b. "Using a genetic algorithm to optimize a data-limited catch rule." *ICES Journal of Marine Science* 78 (4): 1311–23. https://doi.org/10.1093/icesjms/fsab018.

—. 2023. "Risk equivalence in data-limited and data-rich fisheries management: An example based on the ICES advice framework." *Fish and Fisheries* 24 (2): 231–47. https://doi.org/10.1111/faf.12722.

- ICES. 2022. "ICES technical guidance for harvest control rules and stock assessments for stocks in categories 2 and 3." In *Report of ICES Advisory Committee*, 2022. ICES Advice 2022, Section 16.4.11, 20 pp. International Council for the Exploration of the Sea (ICES). https://doi.org/10.17895/ices.advice.19801564.
- Jardim, Ernesto, Manuela Azevedo, and Nuno M. Brites. 2015. "Harvest control rules for data limited stocks using length-based reference points and survey biomass indices." *Fisheries Research* 171 (November): 12–19. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.fishres.2014.11.013.